Models and frameworks: Grounding implementation and dissemination research in theoretical approaches

Denise Campbell-Scherer MD, PhD and Thea Luig PhD
University of Alberta
Models and frameworks: Grounding implementation and dissemination research in theoretical approaches

Denise Campbell-Scherer MD, PhD and Thea Luig PhD
University of Alberta
Theory Framework Model
Theories ...

... explain cause-and-effect relationships

- Grand theories
- Mid-range theories
- Lower-level theories
Frameworks

... link descriptive concepts or variables that account for phenomena into a structure that can serve to measure and evaluate
Models

Simplified representation of phenomena. In contrast to theories, models are descriptive and have a narrowly defined scope.

Example: Chronic Care Model
The Expanded Chronic Care Model
Models and frameworks: Grounding implementation and dissemination research in theoretical approaches

Denise Campbell-Scherer MD, PhD and Thea Luig PhD
University of Alberta
Normalization process theory - Implementation theory

Frameworks

... link descriptive concepts or variables that account for phenomena into a structure that can serve to measure and evaluate
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender Development</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation of Tramaine</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A conceptual model of knowledge</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge, Behavior, and Practices of Health Practices</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preventing Maternal Mortality</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrition, Education, and Health</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A framework for identifying vulnerable populations</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A framework for identifying vulnerable populations</td>
<td>Dtcp</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interventions

simple                   complex

Example for interventions aiming to change behaviors:

Theoretical Domains Framework
33 behaviour change theories
128 constructs sorted into 14 domains
Conceptual Implementation Framework for 5As of Obesity Management:
Theoretical Domains Framework for Behaviour Change for the Provider

Environmental Context & Resources:
See Conceptual Framework of Complex Innovation Implementation

Knowledge:
- 5As Toolkit for Obesity Management, The PCN task environment, Background Knowledge

Skills:
- Development Competence
- Ability
- Interpersonal skills
- Practice
- Skill Assessment

Intentions:
- Stability (organization, provider)
- Stages of Change

Goals:
- Goals (distal, proximal), Target setting, Goal Priority, Goals (autonomous/controlled), Action Planning, Implementation Intention

Belief about Consequences

Social / Professional Role & Identity:
- Professional confidence, Group identity, Leadership, Organizational Commitment

Social Influences:
- Social pressure, social & group norms, group conformity, Social supports, Intergroup conflict, Power, Group Identity, Alienation, Modeling

Emotion:
- +/- affect
- Burn-out Fear, Anxiety

Optimism

Behavioural regulation:
- Self-monitoring

Memory, Attention & Decision Processes
Models and frameworks: Grounding implementation and dissemination research in theoretical approaches

Denise Campbell-Scherer MD, PhD and Thea Luig PhD
University of Alberta
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Dissemination and/or Implementation</th>
<th>Construct flexibility: broad to operational</th>
<th>Socioecologic Level</th>
<th>References</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Diffusion of Innovation</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RAND Model of Persuasive Communication and Diffusion of Medical Innovation</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effective Dissemination Strategies</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Model for Locally Based Research Transfer Development</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streams of Policy Process</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>25, 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Conceptual Model of Knowledge Utilization</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptual Framework for Research Knowledge Transfer and Utilization</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conceptualizing Dissemination Research and Activity: Canadian Heart Health Initiative</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>29, 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Framework for Increasing Diffusion of Evidence-Based Physical Activity Interventions</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blueprint for Dissemination</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Framework for Knowledge Translation</td>
<td>D-only</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Framework for Analyzing Adoption of Complex Health Innovations</td>
<td>D &gt; 1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>×</td>
<td>34, 35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Construct flexibility
Socioecologic framework level:

System, community, organization, individual
Implementation and/or Dissemination
Implementation

Nilsen (2015): Making sense of implementation theories, models & frameworks
Reach into the target population
Effectiveness of the intervention
Adoption by target settings
Implementation including consistency and cost of delivery
Maintenance of intervention effects over time
Group discussion

Campbell-Scherer, DL, Asselin J, Osulana A, et al. Implementation and evaluation of the 5As framework of obesity management in primary care: design of the 5As Team (5AsT) randomized control trial.
Discussion of Examples
Final Thoughts

Thinking about implementation - either a new innovation requiring a change in clinical mindlines systematizing evidence-based practice reproducibly in a setting - benefits from reflecting on NPT.

Frameworks are useful structures for planning your implementation strategy and for guiding your approach to evaluation of your intervention.

Both interventions and implementation processes in the real world are best thought of as iterative, with ongoing refinement through bidirectional knowledge transfer between those doing the work with tacit knowledge of task and context, and those with the theoretical and content knowledge of the intervention.